

Should You Take The Pay Out?

Ford Motor Company recently announced that as many as 90,000 current salaried retirees will be given the opportunity to “cash in” their defined benefit pensions for lump-sum payments. Those who accept the offer will be trading in a guaranteed stream of lifetime income for a large infusion of cash, which will in essence resemble a traditional, self-managed IRA on a go-forward basis.

In a world where most defined benefit pension plans have been replaced by defined contribution 401(k) plans for younger workers, Ford’s recent offer is a sign of the times. However, Ford’s offer is unique, as it is the first offer of this size that applies to retirees who have already started receiving lifetime pension income.

While Ford has yet to release any detailed numbers, many will be looking at a lump sum offer that may be worth several hundred thousand dollars. At first glance, some retirees may be licking their chops in anticipation of receiving a large six-figure payout. On the flip side, those who are more pessimistic may think that Ford is trying to shortchange retirees.

Why has Ford made this offer? With any defined benefit pension plan, the employer agrees to make lifetime payments to retirees and must continually “fund”

those future obligations. The employer shoulders all of the investment risk. The amount that the company must put into the fund in any one year is a function of the current assets in the fund, the anticipated rate of return on the fund’s assets, employees’ years of service with the company, employees’ current and future pay, current interest rates, and the life expectancy of the pension fund participants. Some of these inputs are predictable, but many are not. As a result, companies with pension plans have had to traverse a lot of uncertainty, especially as workers have grown older, the number of retirees has increased and life expectancies have continually inched upward. Further, fund investment mandates have become more conservative following the most recent bear market (i.e. targeting lower investment returns and lower levels of risk), while interest rates on bonds have plummeted.

At the end of 2011, Ford’s US benefit obligations were roughly \$49 billion, which was greater than the fund’s assets of \$39 billion. The plan was essentially “underfunded” by \$10 billion and Ford had planned to contribute \$3.8 billion toward those obligations in 2012 alone. From a business planning perspective, Ford is not trying to pull a fast one on retirees. Rather, the company is looking to mitigate uncertainty. Management is willing to put the cash up today (in the form of pension payouts) in order to provide more

summaries

clarity going forward. They've also been kind enough to make the payout optional.

So who should take the buyout? The following sections look to highlight several points that should be considered before making a decision.

Life Expectancy

A defined benefit pension payout will be calculated based upon the retiree's life expectancy. The fund assumes that the beneficiary and their spouse (if named as a survivor) will live to be an average age. The longer a beneficiary actually lives, the harder it will be to justify taking the lump sum distribution. For example, if a retiree has a long family history of great health and longevity, then retaining the lifetime pension may be the best option. On the other hand, if the retiree and their spouse (if named as a survivor) are in poor health, then taking the lump-sum distribution may be more advantageous.

Spouse Survivor Option

Almost all defined benefit pensions allow for the beneficiary to take their benefit as a single life annuity (i.e. income ceases when they die) or as a life annuity with a survivor option (i.e. their spouse is entitled to a predetermined percent of the benefit after the retiree dies). Further, this election is irrevocable. In some cases, a retiree may have opted to not include their spouse as a survivor because doing so would reduce their own lifetime payments – how selfish! That retiree may come to regret their decision if they've now become ill and their spouse will soon be left

with no pension income. If this is the case, taking the payout will allow those assets to be used for the spouse's support, even after the retiree has passed.

Plan Funding Status

Ford's Pension is currently 80 percent funded. In other words, the fund assets are only 80 percent as large as the liabilities. If a plan is severely underfunded, there is a risk that retirees may not receive the benefits that they have been promised. With Ford, considering the contributions that they are making to the plan (\$3.8 billion for 2012) along with the recovery that they've had in their overall business, it seems reasonable to believe that the plan's funding status will remain acceptable. One must also take some comfort in the fact that the pension fund made it through the brutal financial crisis of 2008 and 2009 largely intact.

PBGC Coverage

Every private sector defined benefit pension plan is required to pay insurance premiums to the Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation (PBGC). Much like the FDIC does for failed banks, the PBGC is a government entity that takes over failed pension plans. Similarly, just as the FDIC has limits on the amount of assets that it will cover for any single depositor at a failed bank (currently \$250,000), the PBGC has limitations on what benefits it will guarantee for private sector retirees that are covered by a failed pension plan. For those who have pension benefits that are above PBGC guaranteed maximums, which vary based upon age, a lump-sum payment may make sense if the pension plan in question is severely underfunded. Again, the

Ford plan may not fit this description, but knowing if a promised benefit would be completely covered by the PBGC in the event of plan insolvency is a consideration nonetheless.

Income Tax Flexibility

Private pension benefits are considered taxable income to the recipient. As a result, income tax is due on benefits as they are received evenly over time. With an IRA, distributions are taxable income as well, but the owner has more control over the timing of distributions. This income tax flexibility most often comes into play when a retiree has high deductible expenses (usually medical or nursing home related). Sometimes, substantial balances can be distributed out of an IRA without any tax being due, because of offsetting deductible expenses.

In other instances, a retiree may find themselves in a low tax bracket, at which point converting some pre-tax IRA dollars to after-tax Roth IRA dollars may make sense. This is especially applicable if the retiree anticipates a future rise in their tax rate, or if their heirs are in a higher tax bracket. A pension cannot be converted to a Roth IRA, while a traditional IRA account can be converted.

Income Needs and Generational Planning

Some pension recipients do not need the current income that their pension provides. Rather than having continual taxable income, some would prefer to have an IRA account and only take out the IRS mandated required minimum distribution. By doing so, any

assets remaining in the IRA would continue growing on a tax-deferred basis over time for their heirs.

Further, a pension essentially acts like a bond. It is conservative in nature and pays a predictable amount of cash for a pre-determined period of time. For some retirees whose income needs are already met without the pension, there may be a desire to invest those assets more aggressively for long-term growth, whether it be for their children's or grandchildren's eventual benefit. If this is the case, then a lump sum distribution may make sense.

Inflation

Many defined benefit pension plans do not adjust for inflation. A \$1,000 monthly benefit today will still be \$1,000 in 20 years, even if the cost of living has risen substantially. If a retiree is living solely off of their pension and that pension does not have a cost of living adjustment, they will eventually run into a funding shortfall due to inflation. For those who are more susceptible to this situation, a lump-sum distribution, subsequently managed to combat the effects of inflation over time may make sense.

Willingness to Forgo Predictability

Arguably the most beneficial aspect of a defined benefit pension plan is the predictability that it affords the retiree. The retiree does not have to look at fluctuating market values or ride out equity bear markets in order to meet predetermined income goals. A check shows up every month and all investment risk is shouldered by the employer. Even if the eventual payout offer

local independent personal accessible
interactive creative local independent personal
knowledgeable thoughtful ethical experienced

for Ford retirees is quite attractive, one must not underestimate the value that lifetime predictability brings.

Self-Control

Finally, it should be noted that any retiree who opts to cash out their pension plan and roll the balance over into an IRA must be able to exhibit self-control. What was previously a predictable stream of cash flow from an asset base that could not be accessed will immediately become fair game for current consumption.

Once actual numbers are distributed to eligible Ford retirees, all of the above considerations will need to be carefully considered. From a mathematical point of view, with the numbers in hand, one will be able to say “if I live to be age X and I can earn Y percent on my investments, then it makes more sense to cash out”. In reality, one must be uniquely suited on a number of fronts in order to benefit in a material way from cashing out a defined benefit pension plan.

Christopher W. Frayne, CFA, CFP®

The information published herein is provided for informational purposes only, and does not constitute an offer, solicitation or recommendation to sell or an offer to buy securities, investment products or investment advisory services. All information, views, opinions and estimates are subject to change or correction without notice. Nothing contained herein constitutes financial, legal, tax, or other advice. The appropriateness of an investment or strategy will depend on an investor's circumstances and objectives. These opinions may not fit to your financial status, risk and return preferences. Investment recommendations may change and readers are urged to check with their investment advisors before making any investment decisions. Information provided is based on public information, by sources believed to be reliable but we cannot attest to its accuracy.

Please remember to contact Sigma Investment Counselors if there are any changes in your financial situation or investment objectives